



HON. SYLVIA O. HINDS-RADIX  
Corporation Counsel

THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
**LAW DEPARTMENT**  
100 CHURCH STREET  
NEW YORK, NY 10007

NICOLETTE PELLEGRINO  
Assistant Corporation Counsel  
Phone: (212) 356-2338  
Fax: (212) 356-3509  
Email: npellegr@law.nyc.gov

September 8, 2023

VIA E.C.F.  
Honorable Arun Subramanian  
United States District Judge  
United States District Court  
Southern District of New York  
500 Pearl St.  
New York, New York 10007

Re: Christopher Hiram Cano v. City of New York, et al.,  
19 Civ. 1640 (LGS)

Your Honor:

I am an Assistant Corporation Counsel in the Special Federal Litigation Division of the New York City Law Department and the attorney representing defendants the City of New York, New York City Health and Hospitals, New York City Department of Correction ("DOC") Captains Charles and Robinson, and DOC Officers Chisolm and Santiago (collectively, "Defendants") in the above-referenced matter. Defendants write to respectfully request that (a) the summons issued yesterday at Docket Number 186 be sealed, precluding Plaintiff or anyone besides defense counsel from accessing it, and (b) defendant Murray's personal address and any other contact information remains confidential and does not get publicized on the electronic docket or be shared with Plaintiff.

By way of relevant background, on July 5, 2023, the Court held, *inter alia*, that by "July 12, 2023, Defendants shall file a letter on ECF with any contact information for Murray that they are able to locate through reasonable diligence, to assist the U.S. Marshals in effectuating service." (Dkt. No. 178.) The Court further held that "[s]uch letter may be filed under seal **because it contains confidential personal information.**" (*Id.*) (emphasis added).

Indeed, the Court acknowledged that defendant Murray's personal contact information, including her home address, was to remain confidential and was not be shared with the public or Plaintiff.

Accordingly, on July 5, 2023, the Defendants provided defendant Murray's service address *ex parte* under seal and provided a redacted copy to Plaintiff. (See Dkt. No. 179.)

However, on September 7, 2023, an electronic summons was issued for defendant Murray, and the Clerk of Court publicized defendant Murray's "confidential personal information" (Dkt. No. 178) on the Electronic Docket. (See Dkt. No. 186.) But, as already acknowledged by the Court and Defendants, such personal information should remain confidential and is not to be publicized on the docket or shared with Plaintiff.

Accordingly, Defendants respectfully request that (a) the summons issued yesterday at Docket Number 186 be sealed, precluding Plaintiff or anyone besides defense counsel from accessing it, and (b) defendant Murray's personal address and any other contact information remains confidential and does not get publicized on the electronic docket or be shared with Plaintiff.

The Defendants thank the Court for its consideration.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Nicolette Pellegrino  
Nicolette Pellegrino  
Assistant Corporation Counsel  
Special Federal Litigation Division

CC: VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL  
Christopher Hiram Cano  
B&C No. 8952200296  
09-09 Hazen Street  
East Elmhurst, New York 11370

The motion is GRANTED. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to restrict viewing access of Dkt. No. 186 to the Court and the Defendants. The Clerk is also directed to terminate the motion at Dkt. No. 187.

SO ORDERED.



Arun Subramanian, U.S.D.J.  
Date: September 8, 2023